

Report of the Director of Place to the meeting of Corporate Overview & Scrutiny Committee to be held on 8th December 2022

W

Subject:

HATE CRIME SCRUTINY REVIEW

Summary statement:

This report provides an update to the recommendations from the findings from the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review

EQUALITY & DIVERSITY:

Our work on supporting communities is designed to be inclusive and benefit all local service delivery across the district. Whilst this is right and consistent with the principle of equalities at the heart of everything we do; it is also the case that our investment needs to demonstrate how it is enabling us to make sustainable progress in equality, diversity and inclusion and culture. Our team supports communities with protected characteristics to create actions plans and provide them with voice and engagement for developing services and policies.

All grant funded, contracted partners and projects recognise the single statutory duty to promote equality under the Equality Act 2010. All our partners ensure and demonstrate that services delivered have due regard to:

- eliminate unlawful discrimination, harassment and victimisation and other conduct that is prohibited by or under the Equality Act 2010
- advance equality of opportunity between persons who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it
- foster good relations between people who share a relevant protected characteristic and persons who do not share it

Alan Lunt
Interim Strategic Director
Department of Place

Report Contact: Ian Day
Phone: (01274) 433507
E-mail: ian.day@bradford.gov.uk

Portfolio:

Neighbourhoods & Community Safety

Overview & Scrutiny Area

Corporate

1. SUMMARY

- 1.1 Bradford Hate Crime Alliance (BCHA) is funded through the Safer Communities Partnership and reports on a quarterly basis through the Hate Crime Strategic Group chaired by the Stronger Communities manager. BCHA has carried out work in response to the hate Crime Scrutiny review and recommendations.
- 1.2 BCHA Hate Crime provides ongoing support to reporting centres to increase awareness of hate crime reporting, will deliver training to new reporting centres during the year and complete annual audit of reporting centres. BCHA compiles reports from victims, third party reporters and reporting pathways. This data is shared with strategic partners including Police, local authority, and community safety partners to challenge perpetrators and further ensure we have a joined-up approach to identifying risk factors. The information collected allows us to support victims and provide analysis to build a better understanding of hate crime in our district.
- 1.3 The key work priorities of Bradford Hate Crime Alliance are set against the strategy for tackling hate crime in Bradford and District and against the national priorities for tackling hate crime. Preventing Hate Crime – by increasing the understanding of what constitutes a hate crime and its effect on victims and the wider community; challenging attitudes and hostility within the community by educating young people about the impact of hate crime and by raising the awareness of front-line staff to encourage them to support the victims of hate crime.
 - Increasing reporting of hate crime – by increasing the awareness of reporting methods throughout the city to empower victims to report incidents, promote online and anonymous reporting, publish details of where victims and witnesses can get help, advice, and support and to target vulnerable and isolated communities at risk of hate crime to advise what action can be taken
 - Effective action against perpetrators – In partnership with the Crown Prosecution Service - working collectively to address hate crimes and to publish success when taking action against perpetrators.
 - Supporting victims of Hate Crime – by working with partners and third-party reporting centres to ensure that support services are effectively signposted to victims and vulnerable communities. Provide one to one support for victims of crime.
 - Improving partnership responses – by ensuring information and analysis of hate crimes and emerging threats is shared across the partnership, identifying emerging communities who are at risk of hate crime and working together to prevent and protect.

Please see the table below showing hate crime in the district by protected characteristic.

Hate Incident Breakdown by Hate Strand ➔

Short Term Trend

Hate Strand	Last 3 Months	Same Period Last Year	Change	% Change	% Selected
Disability	84	61	23	37.7 %	11.9%
Faith	59	56	3	5.4 %	8.3%
Race	475	493	-18	-3.7 %	67.2%
Sexual Orientation	86	79	7	8.9 %	12.2%
Strand Not Recorded	51	33	18	54.5 %	7.2%
Transphobic	17	22	-5	-22.7 %	2.4%

Long Term Trend

Hate Strand	Last 12 Months	Same Period Last Year	Change	% Change	% Selected
Disability	294	226	68	30.1 %	10.5%
Faith	217	187	30	16.0 %	7.7%
Race	1,910	1,982	-72	-3.6 %	67.9%
Sexual Orientation	317	316	1	0.3 %	11.3%
Strand Not Recorded	233	118	115	97.5 %	8.3%
Transphobic	60	51	9	17.6 %	2.1%

2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 A hate crime can be committed against a person or a property. A victim does not have to be a member of the group at which the hostility is targeted. In fact, anyone could be a victim of a hate crime.

Definitions: Hate crime and hate incidents

- **A hate crime** is defined as any criminal offence which is perceived, by the victim or any other person, to be motivated by hostility or prejudice based on a person’s race, religion, sexual orientation, transgender identity or disability, or the perception of the person of having any of these characteristics.
- **A non-crime** (i.e. anything that is not a criminal offence) is defined as a **hate incident**. This victim-centered definition of hate crime and hate incidents is very much part of Stephen Lawrence’s legacy.

2.2 Definition of hate crime

The current definition of a hate crime, issued jointly by the police and the Crown Prosecution Service, is:

“Any criminal offence which is perceived by the victim or any other person, to be motivated by hostility or prejudice, based on a person’s disability or perceived disability; race or perceived race; or religion or perceived religion; or sexual orientation or perceived sexual orientation or transgender identity or perceived transgender identity.”

Perception – what does that mean?

Perception is the way we understand something or make sense of it. So, if you believe that you have been targeted because of who you are, or you witness something that you believe is motivated by hostility toward someone specifically because of who they are,

then that could be a hate crime. Alternatively, it can also be the perpetrator's perception of another individual. If a perpetrator sees someone and makes an assumption about their race or sexuality based on first impression, clothing, or who they are with for example, whether that assumption is correct or not, and attacks them based on that assumption, then this could also be a hate crime.

3. OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

The work undertaken under each of the recommendations from the Hate Crime Review are presented below.

- 3.1. A consistent theme throughout all of the information gathering sessions for this Scrutiny Review was that there was a lot of under reporting of Hate Crime across the District especially amongst the following communities:
- New and emerging communities such as Roma and travelling communities.
 - South Asian women, with cultural barriers being a contributory factor here.
 - Eastern European, Central European and refugee communities.

Under reporting of Hate Crime across the District

- 3.2 **Recommendation 1:** That to reduce underreporting of Hate Crime within specific groups, Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance should undertake targeted work particularly with those groups that are known to underreport.

Address the key challenge of enabling and encouraging people to report Hate Crime, improve the levels of satisfactory outcome's by ensuring that every hate crime victim is contacted and explained that their incident is being taken seriously.

The need for a wider breadth of hate crime awareness work is growing which has led to exploration of different areas that need to be covered:

The true meaning of hate crime. Any social media search will show this phrase being misappropriated. Media indifference to accuracy of hate crime has led to a general misunderstanding of what truly constitutes a hate crime.

Freedom of Speech – the Miller case and Law Commission recommendations could lead to misunderstanding of the true meaning of freedom of speech and therefore lead to an increase in hate crime due to people's misconception of what they are and are not legally allowed to say. Freedom of speech does not constitute the right to say whatever you want.

Gathering evidence – so many cases are dismissed due to a lack of evidence. Awareness of what constitutes valid evidence in a hate crime case is essential.

Early intervention in schools – the need for bespoke workshop materials that schools can access as a means of tackling the systemic issues of bullying, specifically homophobic and misogynistic in nature that are evident in schools across the district. Potential to incorporate drama workshops and the possibility to develop an overall school's package that meets PHSE and Ofsted criteria to market to schools across the district.

The need for **specific awareness material** to be developed around hate crime and suitable material for those suffering from learning disabilities who are particularly vulnerable to this.

- 3.3 **Recommendation 2:** Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, along with other key partners develop a programme of Hate Crime events, for all communities across the District, aimed at raising the awareness of the importance of reporting Hate Crime.

The main focus of Hate Crime Awareness week will be the official launch of our new website and hate crime reporting app, together with events to raise awareness of hate crime reporting across the community.

Recruitment of key hubs to work alongside us as reporting centres / pathways by identifying communities across the district who do not have immediate access to current reporting provision. This has led to:

Specific work with the Roma community on filming an awareness project specific to them with the potential for Connecting Roma to become the designated reporting centre for the Roma community.

Platforms for raising awareness:

- Greater social media presence identified as essential to BHCA moving forward.
- Podcasts could provide a platform of awareness which also would enable us to cover multiple aspects and subjects within it.

- 3.4 **Recommendation 3:** Bradford Hate Crime Alliance and key partners work together to establish easy recording mechanisms, such as utilising mobile phone technology, which can report hate incidents in a confidential way and request only the key information of location, time and type.

Bradford Hate Crime Alliance have been working closely with the University of Bradford to develop an online App that enables people across the District to report hate crime online using their mobile phones.

Bradford District Hate Crime Web Application:

- Widespread publicity campaign
- Ongoing awareness training and web app tuition package for not only reporting centres but any community organisation
- In depth data analysis to understand the impact of the app.

Bradford Hate Crime Alliance manage 24 Hate Crime Reporting Centres across the District, where people can report hate crimes or incidents. Some people prefer or felt more comfortable reporting hate crime at one of the designated Hate Crime Reporting centres rather than reporting directly to the Police. It is therefore imperative that the staff at these Reporting Centres have the necessary training and experience to deal with the reports satisfactorily.

- 3.5 **Recommendation 4:** Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator work with Bradford Hate Crime Alliance to deliver refresher training to all individuals at Hate

Crime Reporting Centres who are responsible for receiving Hate Crime report and also to develop a refresher programme for regular training, as well as developing a programme of after-care support for individuals who report Hate Crime.

All staff responsible for recording hate crime reporting information at the 24 Centres (18 Reporting Centres and 6 Reporting Pathways), managed by the BHCA, have received training during 2021. BHCA have an on-going programme to provide training to hate crime reporting centres annually. Management at these Reporting Centres are also required to inform the BHCA when they have staff changes in order that training can be provided to new staff on a 'as and when necessary' basis.

- 3.6 **Recommendation 5:** The Hate Crime and Community Cohesion Co-ordinators works towards raising the understanding of Hate Crime across all local communities in the District, to enable local communities to better understand cohesion and tolerance that leads towards cohesive and peaceful communities.

BHCA has been looking at new ways to circulate awareness material. The hate crime co-ordinator wrote an in-depth article on hate crime awareness and how to report hate crime for the summer issue of Manningham Housing Associations news magazine. This has been sent to a total of 6000 tenants from minority ethnic backgrounds. A promotional video to raise hate crime awareness within the Roma community made in conjunction with Connecting Roma has received 320 views

- 3.7 **Recommendation 6:** Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator and Bradford Hate Crime Alliance, liaise with Morley Street Resource to develop and deliver a bespoke training session for Disabled groups, aimed at improving their understanding of Hate Crime and also of how they can report Hate Crime incidents.

BHCA have been working closely with the Morley Street Centre as part of the annually contracted work in order to develop and deliver four 'Understanding disability hate crime' online training sessions during 2021-22, aimed at improving their understanding of Hate Crime and reporting Hate Crime incidents.

BHCA is in regular contact with the Morley Street Centre Manager, via phone and emails, to discuss training, however this Centre remains closed at present. We are not sure when it will re-open. A planning meeting has been held regarding finding alternative ways in which BHCA can support Morley Street.

- 3.8 **Recommendation 7:** Material is produced for support workers in the areas of disability, mental health, sign language and translation services to increase awareness of Hate Crime services.

The easy read version of the Hate Crime Strategy 2021-24 has now been made available to all communities. BHCA mobile App has been designed so that it can be shared between different users including sign language. Protected characteristics groups have contributed to ensure robust coverage. The redevelopment of the BHCA website and the launch of the new mobile App is encouraging more people to report hate crimes.

3.9 **Recommendation 8:** Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator works with Partner organisations to develop a simple, easy to understand explanation of what is hate crime and for this to be used in awareness raising materials and campaigns.

BHCA currently have in place an easy read version of our hate crime strategy. This will be able to be accessed through the new website as a downloadable resource, and the new hate crime reporting app is now being rolled out which has a sign language message and translation services.

Awareness presentations and workshops have been given to Equality Together, Shipley Area Co-ordinators, the Women's Health Network and HSAG.

3.9.1 **Recommendation 9:** Facilitate the development of a Multi-Agency Hate Crime Group consisting of key groups and partners, aimed at the sharing of resources, co-ordination of work being undertaken for Hate Crime across the whole of the Bradford District and a more joined up approach to supporting victims of Hate Crime.

The Councils Hate Crime Lead chairs a multi-agency Hate Crime Strategic Management Group (SMG) comprising of:

- Councils Safer and Stronger teams from the Neighbourhood Services (Hate Crime, Bradford for Everyone and Prevent),
- BHCA,
- West Yorkshire Police;
- Victims Support and,
- Restorative Justice

Case management meetings have been instigated by the BHCA hate crime co-ordinator with the co-ordinators from WYP during their Wednesday visit to BHCA HQ. These take place to discuss relevant cases where both WYP and BHCA are involved. Five such meetings were held in the last quarter.

3.9.2 **Recommendation 10:** Bradford Councils Hate Crime Co-ordinator works with the Morley Street Resource Centre, in developing a Disability Hate Crime Group, aimed at providing specific and focused Hate Crime training and support to all Disabled groups.

Talks with Morley Street are ongoing regarding proposed projects to facilitate this, however until they are able to open formally, we cannot facilitate this particular remit.

Collaboration with Equality Together to tackle the reporting provision for the disabled and the deaf community particularly together with the development of material that is fully accessible for them.

The need for specific awareness material to be developed around hate crime and suitable material for those suffering from learning disabilities who are particularly vulnerable to this.

- 3.9.3 **Recommendation 11:** There be a wider debate and discussion, focusing on encouraging greater integration across the District schools and to promote greater cohesion.

Early intervention in schools – the need for bespoke workshop materials that schools can access as a means of tackling the systemic issues of bullying, specifically homophobic and misogynistic in nature that are evident in schools across the district. Potential to incorporate drama workshops and the possibility to develop an overall school's package that meets PHSE and Ofsted criteria to market to schools across the district.

- 3.9.4 **Recommendation 12:** Bradford Council works with its partners with a view to developing a programme of sharing best practice and resources, to target and address Hate Crime more effectively across the District.

Bradford Council in conjunction with BHCA continues to work with partners including Police, Education, Victim Support, Restorative Justice Hub, Crown Prosecution Services, Metro, Safer Stronger Communities, Social Housing providers, Bradford University, HIRC and Adult Services ensuring a joined-up approach and commitment to addressing hate crime in the district.

BHCA continues to provide a comprehensive service to Hate Crime Victims as part of their contract agreement with the Bradford Council.

- 3.9.5 **Recommendation 13:** Bradford Council's Hate Crime Co-coordinator explore possible funding streams, to carry out Hate Crime work, including but not limited to, awareness raising, preventative work and support activities.

Communication and Awareness raising

- 3.9.6 **Recommendation 14:** That Bradford Council and key partners work with schools to encourage training and development, where resources allow, of Hate Crime to support both staff and pupils to raise awareness and knowledge.

Two workshops carried out for Bradford College's 14-16 provision. In depth work has been carried out at Laisterdyke Academy where workshops have been delivered to all six form groups of year 7, 8 and 9. Yr 10 to be completed next quarter.

The entire faculty of Laisterdyke Academy took part in a bespoke workshop entitled "Empowering Teachers to Tackle Hate".

- 3.9.7 **Recommendation 15:** The use of social media be considered, to show examples of good practice where Hate Crime has been successfully dealt with.

Currently BHCA has the following platforms;
Facebook, LinkedIn, Twitter, the BHCA web page, and YouTube. Since it's relaunch, the facebook page continues to grow and in the last quarter reached 1580 people.

The new BHCA Web Page, has been launched with new content, comprising interactive aspects and informative and educational short video clips have been included.

The twitter account has been completely re-launched and new followers gained that are both current and leading practitioners in the field of hate crime. Posting rates have increased and this has resulted in 11,400 views of all posts for the last quarter.

A new podcast has been launched which has already been picked up to be featured on Bradford Community Broadcasting's Pick of the Podcasts show. BHCA will be starting their own monthly pre-recorded radio broadcast which is due to commence in August. A YouTube channel has also been established that will showcase collaborative work, such as the recent Connecting Roma promotional film.

4. FINANCIAL & RESOURCE APPRAISAL

There are no further financial or resource implications

5. RISK MANAGEMENT AND GOVERNANCE ISSUES

There are no further management and governance issues

6. LEGAL APPRAISAL

There are no further legal implications

7. OTHER IMPLICATIONS

None

7.1 SUSTAINABILITY IMPLICATIONS

There are no further sustainability implications

7.2 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS IMPACTS

There are no further impacts on greenhouse gas admissions

7.3 COMMUNITY SAFETY IMPLICATIONS

The actions outline in this report improve hate crime awareness and reporting leading to improved community safety outcomes.

7.4 HUMAN RIGHTS ACT

There are no further Human Rights implications

7.5 TRADE UNION

There are no further Trade Union implications.

7.6 WARD IMPLICATIONS

There are no further ward implications

7.7 AREA COMMITTEE ACTION PLAN IMPLICATIONS

(for reports to Area Committees only)

None

7.8 IMPLICATIONS FOR CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE

There are no further implications for Children and young people

7.9 ISSUES ARISING FROM PRIVACY IMPACT ASSESMENT

Undertake a Privacy Impact Assessment to determine whether you need to deal with data protection and information security matters arising from the proposal/decision.

8. NOT FOR PUBLICATION DOCUMENTS

None

9. OPTIONS

9.1 To review the actions outlined in this report with a multi-agency panel at the next Hate Crime Strategic Group and report with consideration from this committee.

9.2 To focus on key recommendations from the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review as determined by this committee in the short term.

10. RECOMMENDATIONS

10.1 The Overview & Scrutiny Committee endorses the work by BCHA to meet the actions identified in the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review

10.2 The Overview & Scrutiny makes further recommendations for the issues identified in the Hate Crime Scrutiny Review

11. APPENDICES

Appendix A Hate Crime Scrutiny Review Tuesday 23 March 2021

12. BACKGROUND DOCUMENTS

None